

Sonoma County Landmarks Commission STAFF REPORT

Sonoma County Permit and Resource Management Department
2550 Ventura Avenue, Santa Rosa, CA 95403
(707) 565-7383 FAX (707) 565-8343

FILE: PLP08-0088
DATE: March 3, 2009
TIME: 5:20 P.M.
STAFF: Lisa Posternak

SUMMARY

Applicant: Burbank Housing Development Corporation

Owner: Burbank Housing Development Corporation

Location: 5190 Vine Hill Road, Sebastopol
APN 070-020-022, -037 Supervisorial District No. 5

Subject: Design Review for Demolition of Historic Buildings

PROPOSAL: Demolition of Historic Buildings and Construction of Affordable Housing Development

Environmental Determination: Mitigated Negative Declaration under PLP08-0088

General Plan: UR 10 (Urban Residential, 10 units/acre)

Specific/Area Plan: Not Applicable

Land Use: Residential

Zoning: RR B6 10 F2 VOH (Rural Residential, 10 acre-density, Secondary Floodplain, Valley Oak Habitat)

RECOMMENDATION: Recommend that the Planning Commission recommend approval of demolition of the existing buildings on the subject property under the condition that specific mitigation measures for demolition of the Marshall House and any other significant historic buildings on the subject property are completed before the buildings are demolished.

ANALYSIS

Background:

The subject property is 1.71 acres located in downtown Guerneville on the north side of 5th Street, between Church and Mill Streets. The property is comprised of two parcels: 14119 Mill Street (APN 070-020-022) on the west, and 16312 Mill Street (APN 070-020-037) on the east. The eastern parcel contains a single-family residence and well and a former auto repair shop in two buildings. The western parcel contains a motel wing, two single-family residences, and one multi-family residence.

The project application included a Cultural Resources Survey of the existing structures on the subject property dated January 2009 and an Historic Resource Evaluation of the Marshall House dated May 2008, prepared by Tom Origer and Associates.

The Cultural Resources Survey contains a list of existing structures on the subject property:

Building	Address	APN	Description & Date
A	14119 Mill Street	070-020-022	Motel Wing 1962
B	14119 Mill Street	070-020-022	Single-Family Residence 1948
C	14119 Mill Street	070-020-022	Multi-Family Residence 1948
D	14119 Mill Street	070-030-022	Garage/Shed c.1948
E	16312 Fifth Street	070-030-037	Single-Family Residence c.1880
F	16312 Fifth Street	070-030-037	Automotive Shop c.1950
G	16312 Fifth Street	070-030-037	Automotive Shop 1934

The Cultural Resources Survey and Historic Resource Evaluation contains the following conclusions about the existing structures on the subject property:

14119 Mill Street

- **Motel Wing.** Constructed in 1962 as a wing of the Imperial Lodge, the building is now used as an apartment building. It is not a significant historic resource under California State Register criteria. See the Primary Record in the Cultural Resources Survey for the evaluation of the building's significance.
- **Single-Family Residence.** Constructed in 1948 as part of an early resort complex and significantly modified, the building is now used as a single-family residence. It is not a significant historic resource under California State Register criteria. See the Primary Record in the Cultural Resources Survey for the evaluation of the building's significance.
- **Multi-Family Residence.** Constructed in 1948 as part of an early resort complex and significantly modified, the building is now used as an apartment building. It is not a significant historic resource under California State Register criteria. See the Primary Record in the Cultural Resources Survey for the evaluation of the building's significance.
- **Garage/Shed.** Constructed in the 1950s and likely associated with the machine shop operated by former property owner Clifford Marshall, the building is not a significant historic resource under California State Register criteria. See the Primary Record in the Cultural Resources Survey for the evaluation of the building's significance.

16312 Fifth Street

- **Single-Family Residence.** Constructed in the 1880s as a single-family residence and known as the Marshall House, the building is a significant historic resource under California State Register criteria. The house meets Criterion A because it is one of only three known buildings that predate the 1894 fire that destroyed many of the

buildings in Guerneville. While the house has been modified, most notably the addition at the northwest corner, the design, materials, and workmanship on the original portion of the house are intact thus it retains sufficient integrity to convey history. The building does not meet Criteria B or C. The brick-lined well associated with the house may meet Criterion D. See the Building, Structure, and Object Record in the Historic Resource Evaluation for the evaluation of the building's significance.

- **Automotive Shop Buildings.** The garage constructed in 1934 and the warehouse constructed in the 1950s were used for the machine shop operated by former property owner Clifford Marshall. Later the buildings comprised Noonan's Garage. The buildings are not significant historic resources under California State Register criteria. See the Primary Record in the Cultural Resources Survey for the evaluation of the buildings' significance.

The Historic Resource Evaluation recommends the following mitigation measures if it is not possible to preserve the Marshall House in place on the subject property:

1. Donate the house to an interested party with the means to preserve it at another location; include in the donation agreement a provision that if the building is proposed for demolition in the future, measured drawings and large format photographs of the exterior and interior must be prepared before the building is demolished.
2. Prepare measured drawings and large format photographs of the exterior and interior; file the drawings, photographs, and Historic Resource Evaluation with the Sonoma County Library History Annex and the Russian River Historical Society; and use the drawings and photographs in a display on the site of the new development.

Project Description:

This proposed project is a General Plan Amendment, Zone Change, and Design Review to allow for construction of 48 units of affordable housing, management office, laundry room, and common room on the subject property. The project involves demolition of the existing buildings on the property.

DISCUSSION OF ISSUES

Issue #1: **Significance of Historic Buildings**

The Cultural Resources Survey and Historic Resource Evaluation submitted by the Applicant conclude that the Marshall House at 16312 Fifth Street is a significant historic building. The subject property may contain other significant historic buildings. The Survey and Evaluation conclude that the other historic buildings on the property are not significant. However, the Landmarks Commission may conclude that one or more of these other historic buildings are also significant.

Issue #2: **Impact of Proposed Project on Historic Resources and Appropriate Mitigation Measures**

Demolition of the Marshall House would result in the loss of a significant historic resource, which would be a significant impact of the proposed project. Preserving the Marshall House in place on the subject property would not result in the loss of a significant historic resource.

The Historical Resource Evaluation recommends that if it is not possible to preserve the Marshall House in place on the subject property, that 1) the building should be donated and preserved at another location; and 2) if that is not possible, measured drawings and large format photographs should be prepared to document the building before it is demolished. However, the Landmarks Commission may find that measures other than preserving the building on the subject property or at another location would not mitigate loss of the significant historic Marshall House.

If the Landmarks Commission finds that one or more of the other historic buildings on the subject property are significant, demolition of those buildings would result in the loss of additional significant historic resources, which would be a significant impact of the proposed project.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends that the Landmarks Commission recommend that the Planning Commission recommend approval of demolition of the existing buildings on the subject property under the condition that specific mitigation measures for demolition of the Marshall House and any other significant historic buildings on the subject property are completed before the buildings are demolished.

LIST OF ATTACHMENTS

EXHIBIT A: Cultural Resources Survey and Historic Resource Evaluation